Agenda

i. Introduction to More in Common

ii. America’s Seven Tribes

iii. Differences Across Current Issues

iv. Dimensions of Hidden Architecture: Core Beliefs

v. Deeper Dive: Wings vs. Exhausted Majority

vi. Conclusion and Next Steps
Debates about national identity and immigration, linked to a much wider backlash against globalization and the status quo, have disrupted policymaking and political systems.

More in Common is trying to understand the key drivers of this disruption so that we can identify the most powerful interventions that can be made by philanthropy, non-profits, corporate and political actors.

Our research has convinced us that the key dynamic we need to understand and address is **tribalization and polarization**.
More in Common was established in 2017 with the goal of strengthening open, inclusive and resilient societies and addressing profound threats to democracy from social fracturing, ‘othering’ and the rise of authoritarian populism.

More in Common’s work includes:

- Conducting national population studies of public attitudes
- Building **inclusive narratives** that engage ‘conflicted middle’ audiences
- Facilitating **social connection** between people across the lines of difference
- **Partnerships** with key influencers, civil society and media (UNHCR, OECD, European Commission, Catholic Church, civil society networks)
America’s Seven Tribes
The Hidden Tribes of America is a year-long project launched by More in Common in late 2018 to better understand the forces that drive political polarization and tribalism in the United States today, and to galvanize efforts to address them.

By combining the large-scale sampling of professional polling with critical insights from social science, this study provides a deep look into American political behavior. The research was designed to identify clusters within the American voting population that cohere in their core beliefs.

The Hidden Tribes of America study forms the initial phase of the project.
Hidden Tribes of America | Methodology

- **Phase I**: Quantitative
  
  **Fieldwork timing**: December, 2017 – January, 2018
  
  **Sample**: 8,000 online survey interviews of US citizens using interlocking Census targets to achieve are presentative sample by gender, race, age, education, and geographic region
  
  **Characteristics**: Demographics, partisanship, ideology, cognition, moral values, group identity, political attitudes, and political and media consumption behaviors
  
  **Issue Areas**: immigration and American identity, race and social justice, gender and sexuality, religion and extremism.

- **Phase II**: Qualitative – Illustration and Comprehension | April – May, 2018
America’s Seven Tribes

- Progressive Activists: 8%
- Traditional Liberals: 11%
- Passive Liberals: 15%
- Politically Disengaged: 26%
- Moderates: 15%
- Traditional Conservatives: 19%
- Devoted Conservatives: 6%
Progressive Activists
younger, highly engaged, secular, cosmopolitan, angry

Traditional Liberals
older, open to compromise, rational

Passive Liberals
younger, unhappy, insecure, distrustful, disillusioned

Politically Disengaged
younger, lower income, distrustful, detached, patriotic, conspiratorial

Moderates
engaged, civic-minded, middle of the road, Pessimistic, Protestant

Traditional Conservatives
religious, middle class, patriotic, moralistic

Devoted Conservatives
white, retired, highly engaged, uncompromising, patriotic
Differences Across Current Issues
Why we think we are a 50:50 country

Immigration impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Immigration is good for America, helping sectors of our economy to be more successful and competitive</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigration nowadays is bad for America, costing the welfare system and using resources that could be spent on Americans</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Progressive Activists</th>
<th>Traditional Liberals</th>
<th>Passive Liberals</th>
<th>Politically Disengaged</th>
<th>Moderates</th>
<th>Traditional Conservatives</th>
<th>Devoted Conservatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Agree</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sexual harassment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sexual harassment is commonplace nowadays</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nowadays, too many ordinary behaviors are labelled as sexual harassment</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Progressive Activists</th>
<th>Traditional Liberals</th>
<th>Passive Liberals</th>
<th>Politically Disengaged</th>
<th>Moderates</th>
<th>Traditional Conservatives</th>
<th>Devoted Conservatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>49</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Agree</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

White privilege

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many white people today don’t recognize the real advantages they have</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nowadays white people do not have any real advantages over others</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Progressive Activists</th>
<th>Traditional Liberals</th>
<th>Passive Liberals</th>
<th>Politically Disengaged</th>
<th>Moderates</th>
<th>Traditional Conservatives</th>
<th>Devoted Conservatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>52</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Agree</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Islamophobia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many people nowadays don’t take discrimination against Muslims seriously enough</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Many people nowadays are too sensitive to how Muslims are treated</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All</th>
<th>Progressive Activists</th>
<th>Traditional Liberals</th>
<th>Passive Liberals</th>
<th>Politically Disengaged</th>
<th>Moderates</th>
<th>Traditional Conservatives</th>
<th>Devoted Conservatives</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Agree</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Which of the following statements do you agree with more?
The Hidden Tribes analysis is remarkably effective in predicting people’s views across a wide range of issues.
Immigration

People should be able to take refuge in other countries, including America (% agree)

Refugee screening process is not tough enough (% agree)

Which do you agree with more?

People should be able to take refuge in other countries, including America;

Refugees are not America’s responsibility.

The government’s refugee screening process is not tough enough to keep out possible terrorists;

The government’s refugee screening process works well to keep us safe.

Gender and Sexuality

- Progressive Activists
- Devoted Conservatives
- Male
- Female

- Pervasiveness of sexism (% very common): 76% for Progressive Activists, 37% for Male, 21% for Female
- Frustration with sexism (% very frustrated): 32% for Progressive Activists, 21% for Male, 7% for Female
- Severity of sexism (% very serious): 63% for Progressive Activists, 31% for Male, 20% for Female
- Sensitivity (% saying "Many people nowadays don't take sexism and gender issues seriously enough"): 79% for Progressive Activists, 46% for Male, 41% for Female
Race

Race should not be a factor in the college admissions (% agree)

Which do you agree with more?
Race should not be a factor in the college admissions process; Race should be considered in the college admissions process

In your opinion, how common are acts of racism in the United States today? [Showing very + somewhat common]

Religion

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Science</th>
<th>Religion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progressive Activists</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Liberals</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passive Liberals</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Politically Disengaged</td>
<td></td>
<td>59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderates</td>
<td></td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional Conservatives</td>
<td></td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Devoted Conservatives</td>
<td></td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

US average

Which do you agree with more?
SHOWING] America needs more faith and religion;
America needs more reason and science.
Tribe membership predicts attitudes across political issues better than standard categories (such as party affiliation).
Dimensions of Hidden Architecture: Core Beliefs
The Hidden Tribes show the importance of core beliefs (not just race, gender or class)

• Public opinion research often presents its key insights through the lens of demographics (e.g. the role of gender, income, race, age).

• Attitudinal segmentation shows that other factors can be even more powerful in influencing individuals – such as a person’s values and beliefs.

• People’s views are also shaped by their values about personal responsibility, authoritarianism (e.g. order versus freedom) and victimhood.

• Core beliefs cut across all our visible traits.
The hidden architecture of political behavior

- Group Identity and Tribalism
- Perceived Threat
- Parenting Style and Authoritarianism
- Moral Foundations
- Personal Agency and Responsibility
American identity

Identity: Feeling of losing one’s identity and the human need for belonging can influence how people view immigration — 68% of Americans believe that American identity is disappearing while only 32% agree that it is being strengthened through diversity.

- PAs and the TLs believe that American identity is strengthened by diversity while also showing lower levels of threat perception
- Only 33% of TCs and 10% of DCs believe that American identity is strengthened by diversity
- PLs, PDs, and Ms mostly believe that American identity is disappearing
American identity

To be able to speak English
To be Christian
To be born in America

How important to you are the following items for being truly American?
A high regard for authority and rule of-law or a high sense of perceived threat meant that many opposed illegal immigration.

---

Perceived Threat

Low perceived threat
High perceived threat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Low perception</th>
<th>High perception</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Support for Muslim travel ban</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terrorism in US is common</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Refugee screening isn’t tough enough</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*US average*

Low perception of threat by segment. Low threat is defined as responding "Disagree" to the question, "The world is becoming a more and more dangerous place."

Moral Foundation Theory

Full question texts can be found in Appendix 2.1. Source: More in Common (2018)
Deeper Dive: Wings vs. Exhausted Majority
America divides between an Exhausted Majority (67%) and the tribal Wings (33%)

- Comprised of the four middle tribes: Moderates, Politically Disengaged, Passive Liberals and Traditional Liberals
- **Fed up with polarization and the constant division** and infighting, which has now spread to their families and personal relationships
- **Feel forgotten by the political process** and by political debates that always focus on the views of people on the extremes
- Their views differ but they are similar in being **more flexible, less ideological** and accepting that **compromise is necessary** in politics as in everyday life
The Wings (33%)

• Driven by a tribal us-versus-them view of the world and highly distrustful of the other side

• Dominate public debate - social media and TV pundits

• Hold strong and consistent views across a wide range of issues, with very little diversity of views within their group and less likely to accept compromise

• More than twice as likely to say that they enjoy having arguments with others

• On specific issues, their views can be significantly out of line with other Americans (eg Progressive Activists on political correctness and religion; Devoted Conservatives on police brutality, sexism and the country’s direction)
Language frameworks: immigration

• **Progressive Activists** and **Traditional Liberals** frame immigration issues through the lens of racism, human rights, refugee protection and the positive value of a diverse society.

• **Devoted and Traditional Conservatives** frame immigration as an issue of immigrants defying laws, the government losing control of borders, and doubts about immigrants’ loyalty to America.

• The stance of **Exhausted Majority** groups differs according to the specific immigration issue.
Feeling 'temperature' towards racial and political groups by two wing segments.
Numbers indicate how members of each tribe (lines) feel toward each group (x-axis).
Conclusion
Moving forward

77% of Americans believe our differences are not so great that we cannot come together.
Connecting across lines of difference

• The ultimate winners from polarization and social fracturing are those who drive us-versus-them narratives

• On the other hand, social progress and the advance of inclusive values require a sense of social cohesion and a belief that we are all in it together. Fostering greater cohesion reduces people’s anxieties, makes people more resilient to populist narratives and enables political compromise

• If we are to resolve the issues that divide us without resort to conflict, we need to find ways that help Americans understand each other better and elevate a shared sense of identity and values. A key element of this is building a renewed, inclusive sense of American national identity; another element is building bridges between people with different beliefs and different backgrounds.
Next steps for More in Common...

• Continue an intensive program of engagement with key stakeholders to discuss and amplify the findings of the Hidden Tribes of America study.

• Engage with partner groups to build pilots and further develop insights from the study, with the goal of formulating responses to the crisis of increasing polarization.

• Release further research papers highlighting insights from the study relating to specific issues of interest.