Immigration, Safety and Security
Framing Data to Tell a Better Story
The Immigrant Learning Center

October 4, 2017

Marisa Gerstein Pineau, PhD, Researcher
What is a Frame?

Frames are sets of choices about how information is presented:

What to emphasize, how to explain it, and what to leave unsaid.
Immigration

What's in the Swamp of…

“Them”
- Law Breakers
- Illegal Mexican/Highly-Skilled Asian
- Takers
- Immigration Nostalgia
- Security and Control

“Us”
- Humanist–People are People
- Nation of Immigrants
- Celebrate Diversity

Pragmatism
- Economic Fit
- Make it Work

Fatalism
- Immigration Surge
- Money Talks
- Politics as Usual
- System Too Big and Screwed Up

Black Box

Zero Sum
- Job Competition
- Drain on the System

Punitive
- Secure the Border
- Set an Example–Rational Actor

Tuesday, October 3, 17
How do we use data in our arguments?
Range of options...
Some Good, Some NOT
The Good
THE GOOD

OVER 3 MILLION PEOPLE STRUGGLE TO FEED & CLOTHE THEIR CHILDREN
THIS IS EQUIVALENT TO

What does this mean?
In 2011, over three million people in the UK experienced severe material deprivation. This is 5% of the population.

22 Glastonbury Festivals

33 Wembley Stadiums

The population of Jamaica

THAT IS A LOT OF PEOPLE
The Bad: Mythbusting
In a study of the effects of myth-fact communications:

- People misremembered the myths as true.
- Got worse over time.
- Both older and younger readers made mistakes.
- Attributed false information to the CDC.

The Bad:
Killing Them With Data
The Bad: Unframed Data Gets Framed
The Bad: Unframed Data Gets Framed

26,000 primary age kids were admitted to hospital last year because of tooth decay caused by sugar

#SugarRush

RETWEETS | FAVORITES
---|---
712 | 377

4:07 PM - 3 Sep 2015
The Bad: Unframed Data Gets Framed

26,000 primary age kids were admitted to hospital last year because of tooth decay caused by sugar.

#SugarRush

RETWEETS: 712  FAVORITES: 377

4:07 PM - 3 Sep 2015
The Ugly: Crisis Framing
The Ugly: Crisis Framing

BROKE AND BROKEN?
The Psychological Effects of Poverty
For the more than 40 million Americans in poverty, everyday life is a struggle — buying food, going to school, getting a job. And for a great many of them, what most people think of as simple tasks are also difficult. Let’s explore the picture of poverty in the U.S. and the psychological and physical toll it takes.

POVERTY IN THE U.S.
46.5 million Americans who live below the poverty line
16 million Children living in poverty

3 in 4 Americans who regularly experience physical symptoms caused by stress
76%

Physical and psychological symptoms reported (% of those who reported physical or psychological symptoms who said they had the following symptoms)

- Feeling as though you could cry: 35%
- Feeling nervous: 45%
- Feeling dizzy: 13%
- Muscle tension: 44%
- Teeth grinding: 17%
- Change in appetite: 30%
The Ugly: Framing for Fatalism
The Ugly: Framing for Fatalism
The Ugly: Framing for Fatalism

Obama makes broken promises for a broken immigration ... www.patriottimes.com/.../Article_839a180a-472a-11e4-... Sep 23, 2014
Instead, Latinos are being shown nothing but broken promises and they ... Obama has made a promise to fix ...

How to Fix Our Broken Immigration System: U.S. ... - YouTube
www.youtube.com/watch?v=RX7ix1oE6sE Jun 17, 2014 - Uploaded by The Book Archive
"Immigration reform" in the United States of America is widely used to describe proposals to increase legal ...

Obama: Everyone knows immigration system broken - Video
video.cnbc.com/gallery?video=300332047 Obama: Everyone knows immigration system broken. Thurs 20 Nov 2014 | 8:00 PM ET. President Barack ...

Is the US immigration system broken? - Fox Business Video

How to Fix Our Broken Immigration System
www.youtube.com/watch?v=X4tV
May 29, 2014 - Uploaded by Listener

Another Step Toward Fixing Our Broken Immigration System

CONGRATULATIONS
GONZALES FAMILY,
YOUR GREEN CARDS HAVE FINALLY ARRIVED!
Use *Pragmatism* value when faced with opposition

FrameWorks researchers found that in contentious communications situations, appealing to a *Pragmatism* value worked to undo the damage of an opposing message and regain people’s support for reform.

1. Exposed to a *Moral Argument* appeal, people’s support for immigration reform went up.
2. But when that message was countered with an opposing message, support dropped.
3. An appeal to *Pragmatism* showed the strongest ability to regain some of the lost support.
• Appeal to common sense and practical measures: “We need a common-sense, practical approach. Solutions should come from carefully considering all possible ideas, and then moving forward with the ones that have the best chance of improving our country.”

• Point out how alternative proposals are not practical: “It wouldn’t make sense to send all the people that are in the country without documentation back to their country of origin — this is impractical, and wouldn’t help the situation.”

• Highlight feasibility of reform: “We need to focus on taking reasonable steps toward solutions, rather than adopting impractical measures that don’t have the potential to work.”
Recently, public figures have claimed that immigrants are “killers” and “rapists,” bringing crime to the U.S. Study after study has shown, however, that immigrants—regardless of where they are from, what immigration status they hold, and how much education they have completed—are less likely than native-born citizens to commit crimes or become incarcerated. According to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, while the overall percentage of immigrants and the number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. both increased sharply between 1990 and 2010, the violent crime rate in the U.S. at that time plummeted 45 percent and the property crime rate dropped by 42 percent. Studies have consistently found that immigrants are less likely to be incarcerated than native-born Americans and that there was no correlation between crime rates and levels of immigration. Other studies have in fact found that crime rates are lowest in states with the highest immigration growth rates.
Recently, public figures have claimed that immigrants are “killers” and “rapists,” bringing crime to the U.S. Study after study has shown, however, that immigrants—regardless of where they are from, what immigration status they hold, and how much education they have completed—are less likely than native-born citizens to commit crimes or become incarcerated. According to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, while the overall percentage of immigrants and the number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. both increased sharply between 1990 and 2010, the violent crime rate in the U.S. at that time plummeted 45 percent and the property crime rate dropped by 42 percent. Studies have consistently found that immigrants are less likely to be incarcerated than native-born Americans and that there was no correlation between crime rates and levels of immigration. Other studies have in fact found that crime rates are lowest in states with the highest immigration growth rates.
BEFORE
Recently, public figures have claimed that immigrants are “killers” and “rapists,” bringing crime to the U.S. Study after study has shown, however, that immigrants—regardless of where they are from, what immigration status they hold, and how much education they have completed—are less likely than native-born citizens to commit crimes or become incarcerated. According to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, while the overall percentage of immigrants and the number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. both increased sharply between 1990 and 2010, the violent crime rate in the U.S. at that time plummeted 45 percent and the property crime rate dropped by 42 percent. Studies have consistently found that immigrants are less likely to be incarcerated than native-born Americans and that there was no correlation between crime rates and levels of immigration. Other studies have in fact found that crime rates are lowest in states with the highest immigration growth rates.

AFTER
Immigrants are the key to this country’s economic vitality and new studies suggest they even make our communities safer. According to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, while the overall percentage of immigrants and the number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. both increased sharply between 1990 and 2010, the violent crime rate in the U.S. during that time plummeted 45 percent and the property crime rate dropped by 42 percent. Studies have consistently found that there was no correlation between crime rates and levels of immigration, and that in fact, crime rates are lowest in states with the highest immigration growth rates. Immigration makes our communities safer, which is why we need to take a common-sense, practical approach to immigration reform that makes our immigration system more welcoming, not more punitive.
Immigrants are the key to this country’s economic vitality and new studies suggest they even make our communities safer. According to the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, while the overall percentage of immigrants and the number of undocumented immigrants in the U.S. both increased sharply between 1990 and 2010, the violent crime rate in the U.S. during that time plummeted 45 percent and the property crime rate dropped by 42 percent. Studies have consistently found that there was no correlation between crime rates and levels of immigration, and that in fact, crime rates are lowest in states with the highest immigration growth rates.

Immigration makes our communities safer, which is why we need to take a common-sense, practical approach to immigration reform that makes our immigration system more welcoming, not more punitive.
Avoid these swampy frames:

- Getting out of the shadows
- Worthy, deserving immigrants
- Broken immigration system
- These data speak for themselves
- This is about immigrants’ rights
- This is a problem for population x
- Solution?

And substitute these instead:

- An outdated immigration system
- Creating an immigration system that optimally utilizes the energy and contributions of us all
- Change is possible, feasible, practical
- These data suggest immigration reform will move us forward
- This is about our shared humanity
- We all need a solution to this problem
- SOLUTION! SOLUTION! SOLUTION!
http://frameworksinstitute.org/toolkits/immigration/

Thank you!

www.frameworksinstitute.org @FrameWorksInst FrameWorks Institute

© 2017 FrameWorks Institute

Slides in this presentation were developed by the FrameWorks Institute for individual use and cannot be represented, adapted, or distributed without the express written permission of FrameWorks. All images in this presentation are licensed for the purpose of this presentation only and may not be reproduced elsewhere.